COMMITTEE REPORT

Date: 4 August 2016 Ward: Guildhall

Team: Major and Parish: Guildhall Planning Panel

Commercial Team

Reference: 15/01892/LBC

Application at: Rowntree Wharf Navigation Road York

For: Internal alterations associated with partial conversion of

ground and first floor offices to 34no. apartments

By: Bonner One Ltd

Application Type: Listed Building Consent

Target Date: 11 July 2016 **Recommendation:** Approve

1.0 PROPOSAL

- 1.1 This is a listed building application for the conversion of part of the ground and first floor of an existing former mill building into residential apartments at Rowntree Wharf, York.
- 1.2 The site is within the Central Historic Core Conservation Area, Rowntree Wharf is a Grade II listed building and due to its height and enclosure by water features (Wormalds Cut and the River Foss) on three sides, is a landmark building in this part of the city. It was constructed as a roller flour mill by W G Penty for Sidney Leetham in 1896 and converted (upper floors) to flats in 1990. The building is attached via a mezzanine level access at first floor to a relatively new multi storey car park building providing car parking for the existing office and residential use. A separate application for planning permission has been submitted in respect of the use of the building and associated alterations to allow the residential conversion (15/01891/FULM).
- 1.3 The proposal includes the remodelling of the internal space of the ground and first floor, external alterations to create additional cycle parking, bin storage and landscaping and the introduction of stepped emergency flood and fire exit from the site via the two storey adjacent car park. Vehicular access is from the existing access from Navigation Road. 27 of the existing car parking spaces in the adjacent multi storey car park are provided for the development. The total number of residential units is 34 of which 21 are studio flats, 7 are 1 bedroomed, 5 are two bedroomed and 1 is three bedroomed.
- 1.4 The alterations necessary to allow the conversion include:
- Removal of internal partition walls and replacement with new partitions to create the individual residential units.

Application Reference Number: 15/01892/LBC Item No: 4g

Page 1 of 6

- Removal of a modern staircase within the north eastern corner of the building.
- Alteration to the existing suspended ceiling.
- 1.5 Servicing will be via the existing service channels used for the area of the building already converted to residential development. No alterations are proposed to the existing door and window openings.

PLANNING HISTORY

- 1.6 05/02251/FUL and 05/02258/LBC planning application and listed building consent for the conversion of fifth floor offices to eight apartments with the provision of additional car parking granted permission January 2006.
- 1.7 There have been a number of applications and listed building consents for works to individual flats within the Rowntree Wharf development. These applications are not considered significant to the consideration of the current application.

2.0 POLICY CONTEXT

2.1 Development Plan Allocation:

Areas of Archaeological Interest: City Centre Area 0006

Conservation Area: Central Historic Core CONF

Listed Buildings: Grade 2; Rowntree Wharf Navigation Road York YO1 2XA 0892

2.2 Policies:

CYHE2 Development in historic locations

CYHE3 Conservation Areas

CYHE4 Listed Buildings

3.0 CONSULTATIONS

INTERNAL

Design Conservation and Sustainable Development - Conservation Officer

3.1 No objections to the removal of the staircase in the south east corner it is a modern insertion. The revised heritage statement brings nothing new. The large open floor spaces, and the construction of the floors, including the cast iron columns (are tangible evidence of the past use of the building and contribute to its significance. The revised plans expose one or two more of the columns on each floor to view in the corridor, but this is not enough to give the impression of a continuous run of columns. The passage should be made straight.

Page 2 of 6

As indicated in the heritage statement, the suspended ceilings need to be higher so that the tops of the columns can bee seen, again, particularly in the more public areas. Any need to alter window to achieve privacy should be via blinds not by changes to the windows.

EXTERNAL

Historic England

3.2 The application has been viewed by their specialist staff. Historic England do not wish to offer any comments on the application.

Neighbour Notification and Publicity

3.3 One letter of comment specific to the listed building application has been submitted which says that the alterations proposed should be in keeping with the listed building.

4.0 APPRAISAL

KEY ISSUES

4.1 The main considerations of this listed building consent application is the impact on the special architectural and historic interest of the listed building.

POLICY CONTEXT

- 4.2 Section 16 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 requires local planning authorities to have special regard to the desirability of preserving a listed building, its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest when considering whether to grant listed building consent.
- 4.3 Central government guidance dealing with the heritage environment is contained in chapter 12 of the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF). It directs local planning authorities to give great weight to the conservation of heritage assets and to refuse development that would lead to substantial harm or total loss. Where the harm would be less than substantial the harm should be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal, including securing the optimum viable use (paragraph 134 of the NPPF).
- 4.4 The City of York Draft Local Plan (DLP) was approved for development control purposes in April 2005. Its policies are material considerations in the determination of planning applications, although it is considered that their weight is limited except when they are in accordance with the NPPF.

Page 3 of 6

The relevant policies are HE2 development in historic locations and HE4 listed buildings. The main thrust of these policies is compatible with section 12 of the NPPF.

- 4.5 The planned consultation on the Publication Draft of the City of York Local Plan, which was approved by the Cabinet of the Council on the 25 September 2014, was halted pending further analysis of housing projections. Since then officers have initiated a work programme culminating in a "Local Plan Preferred Sites 2016" document and other supporting technical documents. Members have approved these documents for consultation which commenced on the 18th July 2016 and will run until the 12th September 2016. The emerging Local Plan policies can only be afforded weight at this stage of its preparation, in accordance with paragraph 216 of the NPPF and at the present early stage in the statutory process such weight is limited. However policy D5 says development affecting the setting of a listed building will be supported where its setting is protected; alterations and extensions will generally be supported when they do not harm the special architectural or historic interest of the building or its setting. Demolition of a listed building should be wholly exceptional, requiring the strongest justification.
- 4.6 The site is located within York's Central Historic Core Conservation Area (CHCCA). The CHCCA is described within a number of conservation area character appraisal documents. Rowntree Wharf is within character area 15, Fossgate and Walmgate. It says that 'One of the most prominent landmarks in the area, Rowntree Wharf, can be seen from many points. The best view is that from the walkway on the northern side of the Foss, just outside the Conservation Area boundary.'
- 4.7 In the absence of a formally adopted local plan the most up-to date representation of key relevant policy issues is the NPPF. It is against this Framework and the relevant sections of the Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Area) Act that the application proposal should principally be addressed.

Impact on the Special Architectural and Historic Interest of the Listed Building.

- 4.8 The use of the lower floors to some extent retains large open spaces punctuated by cast iron columns with staircases between the floors. There has however been subdivision by partitions, insertion of suspended ceilings and raised floors in connection with office use. The machinery has gone, but the open spaces, cast iron columns and layout of the building are a tangible link to its use and the technology used in the construction of the building. The significance of the listed building is as a roller mill of late 19th century date, constructed to the design of a prominent local architect, within historic core of the City of York.
- 4.9 At first floor level the original open plan layout is not in evidence, columns have been built around and the ceiling has been lowered covering their top section.

 The new layout will form different compartments and the final amendment to the layout shows straight corridors (originally proposed to be curved) so that evidence of the layout of the columns within the building are retained. Ground floor level has existing compartments set along the outer edge of the floor area however the central area of the floor plate remains open and two lines of columns remain exposed. The proposed layout at ground floor level will lose the sense of spaciousness by creating compartments for each apartments arranged around the window openings, however, like the upper floor, amendments to the scheme have sought to modify the corridors to show a continuous run of columns and the upper section of the columns will be revealed. The scheme proposes no external alterations to the elevations of the Grade II listed building; there are not proposed to be any alterations to the windows. The applicant has confirmed that the windows will not be replaced or double glazed. The floors have already been raised to accommodate services for the previous office use and the ceilings have been lowered.

4.10 Officers consider that in light of previous alterations to the building that the harm to the heritage asset (that is the Grade II listed building) would be less than substantial and in accordance with paragraph 134 of the NPPF less than substantial harm should be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal. The NPPG advises that pubic benefit could be anything that delivers economic, social or environmental progress as described in the National Planning Policy Framework (Paragraph 7). The proposed development will provide housing in a sustainable city centre location, bring the floors of the building into use, introduce a use that is compatible with the residential use within the upper floors of the building and ensure the building's future maintenance. Officers consider that these benefits are sufficient to outweigh the less than substantial harm to the building even when attaching additional weight to the requirements of the Planning Acts. The proposal, therefore, complies with national and local planning policies in respect of the historic environment.

5.0 CONCLUSION

5.1The site is within the Central Historic Core Conservation Area, Rowntree Wharf is a Grade II listed building and due to its height and enclosure by water features (Wormalds Cut and the River Foss) on three sides, is a landmark building in this part of the city. Constructed as a roller flour mill by W G Penty for Sidney Leetham in 1896.

5.2 For the reasons set out in this report the proposal would result in less than substantial harm to heritage assets that, when balanced against the public benefits of the proposal, is considered to be acceptable.

COMMITTEE TO VISIT

6.0 RECOMMENDATION: Approve

Application Reference Number: 15/01892/LBC Item No: 5g

Page 5 of 6

- 1 TIMEL2 Development start within 3 yrs (LBC/CAC)
- 2 PLANS1 Approved Plans
- 3 Large scale details of the following items shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to the commencement of building works. The development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.
- Full details at a scale of 1:20 and 1:50 of the junctions between the internal face of the external walls and the new stud work.
- Large scale details of the alterations to the suspended ceiling and the connection between the ceiling and the upper part of the columns.

Reason: So that the Local Planning Authority may be satisfied with the details in the interests of preserving the special setting of the listed buildings and the character and appearance of the conservation area.

7.0 INFORMATIVES:

1. Note the application details confirm that there will be no requirement for new ventilation or other services to be vented through new wall or roof interventions. Further listed building consent would be required for any such works. Windows are not to be altered. Further listed building consent would be required for works to the existing windows

Contact details:

Author: Diane Cragg Development Management Officer (Mon-Thur)

Tel No: 01904 551351

Page 6 of 6